**UNDER** 

THE COMMISSIONS OF INQUIRY ACT 1908

IN THE MATTER OF

ROYAL COMMISSION OF INQUIRY INTO

BUILDING FAILURE CAUSED BY CANTERBURY

**EARTHQUAKES** 

KOMIHANA A TE KARAUNA HEI TIROTIRO I NGA WHARE I HORO I NGA RUWHENUA O

**WAITAHA** 

STATEMENT OF EVIDENCE OF ANDREW CHRISTIAN IN RELATION TO THE FORSYTH BARR BUILDING

DATE OF HEARING: 23-24 FEBRUARY 2012



# STATEMENT OF EVIDENCE OF ANDREW CHRISTIAN IN RESPECT OF THE FORSYTH BARR HEARING

### Personal Background

- My full name is Andrew Christian. I am the Project Manager for Pace Project Management Limited (Pace) for the earthquake repairs to the Forsyth Barr Building.
   I am a resident of Christchurch.
- I have been asked to give evidence about the instructions that were given to Holmes Consulting Group (HCG) and, specifically, Mr John Hare, following HCGs engagement to prepare a report on the Forsyth Barr building following the 4 September earthquake.
- 3. The property manager for the Forsyth Barr building was Colliers Property Management Limited (Colliers). Mr Michael Connolly and his co-workers John Cole and Tania Sherborne were the Colliers representatives who I dealt with during the post-September work on the building. Pace was engaged by Colliers to manage any repair work that was required.
- 4. For the purposes of preparing my evidence I have been provided with excerpts from the statement of evidence of John Hare dated 28 November 2011. I have been advised that this is evidence that Mr Hare is expected to give at the hearing on the Forsyth Barr building. The excerpt I received began at paragraph 11, under the heading "Extent of Instructions Received" and ended with paragraph 28.
- 5. That statement by Mr Hare refers to me in paragraph 14, 17, 18, 23-27.
- 6. I comment on each of these paragraphs:

Paragraph 17: I recall meeting with John Hare and Mr Sturges on or around that date and carrying out a site inspection.

Paragraph 18: I agree with the general description of the discussion that is said to have taken place. It was a general discussion about proposed cosmetic repair work, to the gib-board walls and stair vinyl, but I did not at any stage give any instructions about the work that HCG was required to carry out. That was a matter for the building owner, through Colliers. More specifically, there was no discussion about whether the structural review being carried out by HCG should include an inspection of the stairs.



Paragraph 23: I do not recall having a discussion with Mr Hare about what he refers to as "the drop" in the stairs.

Paragraph 24: I am not in a position to comment on what Mr Hare may have decided about the need to examine this identified sag. However, I reiterate that I did not at any time have a discussion with him which related to the matters that HCG needed to include in the engineering report it was preparing for Colliers.

Paragraph 25: I had instructed the vinyl layer to lift the vinyl to the stairs and had chatted with a Holmes Engineer (I don't think it was Mr Hare) to indicate when the vinyl was lifted we would inform them that the landings need further inspection, before we relaid the vinyl and this would only be a matter of a couple of days, from lifting. The vinyl was ordered at the beginning of February and was due to be in Christchurch early March. So we were due to be lifting the vinyl in the week commencing 28th February 2011.

Paragraph 26: I agree with Mr Hare that most of the verbal instructions to HCG were from me, although HCG was in regular discussion with Michael Connolly as well, as a number of the emails record. Most of the emails that relate to the work on the building went either to me, copied to Michael Connolly, or vice versa.

Paragraph 27: Again, it is not for me to comment on the extent to which HCG intended its 29 November 2010 report to be a draft only and a "live" document as John Hare says. I do not recall at any time indicating for Holmes or John Hare not to (or to, for that matter) include the condition of the structure of the stairs in their report

My role was to schedule the cosmetic repairs required after the earthquake to the building and facilitate all the repairs to the building, including pricing it and managing workmen on site. I did not at any stage dictate the work HCG was required to carry out under its contract with the building owner, in fact we assisted when required, by providing workmen etc when asked.

A document dated 10 September 2010, that I prepared, is typical of the role Pace played (document reference 5065).

Pace is not a firm of structural engineers and it does not advise on any structural matters either directly or indirectly.



Dated: 20<sup>th</sup> day of February 2012

Signed

**Andrew Christian** 



Novo House Level 1 323 Madras Street PO Box 36-546 Christchurch 8013



Ph +64 3 366 4282 Fax +64 3 366 4283 www.pacepm.co.nz

Job No: 5065

CHRISTCHURCH

TAURANGA

10<sup>th</sup> September 2010

Forsyth Barr House

## Christchurch

#### Vinyl to 2 x Stairwells

Works \$65,700.00

- Uplift existing vinyl to landings where concrete landings have dropped
- Scrape off all glue and grind ready to receive new vinyl
- Where sub-floor is broken, prepare floor and make level
- Note on two landings gaps may require further inspection by engineer after vinyl lifted
- Supply and lay new Commercial grade vinyl to a different colour to the stair treads
- Supply and install new stair tread to landing treads only
- Supply and install aluminium seismic threshold over movement joint in vinyl to all south landings with movement joint in
- Remove all vinyl stringers (from walls) as stairs have all dropped to some extent and replace with new to same height up wall so no need to make good wall.
- One set of stairs requires treads to be built up and new vinyl and nosings
  Exact detail of make good to be determined once vinyl removed and may require engineer's input.

### Design & Project Management

\$4,599.00

- Selection of materials and finishes
- Design and documentation
- Contract pricing and administration
- Coordination of sub contractors and materials
- Required site visits

Total Excluding GST \$70,299.00

No allowance for the following:

- Works outside of normal working hours
- Structural engineers inspections
- Works other than those noted above

