

**89/91/93 CASHEL STREET**  
**Hearing: Tuesday 24 January 2012 at 9.30am**

## **Summary**

These 3 buildings were situated side by side on the north side of Cashel Street around the middle of Cashel Mall.

89 Cashel Street (also referred to as 87-89 Cashel Street) was a 2 storey unreinforced masonry and timber building with a lightweight roof. It appears that the building was constructed around 1878. The building was not listed as a heritage or protected building.

The building that was situated at 91 Cashel St (sometimes referred to as 91A) was a three storey unreinforced concrete and masonry building with a lightweight roof on timber trusses. The building was not listed either as a heritage or historic building.

93 Cashel St (also referred to as 93-95 Cashel St) was a 2 storey unreinforced masonry structure built around 1885. It does not appear to have had heritage or historic places classification either.

The buildings at 89 and 93 Cashel St (on either side of the building at 91 Cashel St) were owned by Hereford Holdings Ltd (Antony Gough). The Building in the middle of the three at 91 Cashel St was owned by West Mall Properties Ltd (Tracy Gough, the brother of Antony Gough).

It appears that 89 Cashel Street had little, if any, structural strengthening work carried out in the past. Correspondence between the owners and the Council in the 1980's indicates that the intention was to demolish the building and redevelop it. The building was occupied on the ground floor by 2 retail premises, Deval and 3 Wise Men.

91 Cashel St also appears to have had no structural strengthening prior to the September 2010 earthquake. The building was occupied on the ground floor by the 123 Mart.

93 Cashel St appears to have had reasonably extensive structural strengthening carried out by Powell Fenwick Consultants in 2007-2009. The Trocadero Bakery occupied tenancies on the ground and 1<sup>st</sup> floor. TS Retail Store was also on the ground floor.

Following the September 2010 earthquake, it was noted in a Level 1 Rapid Assessment that 91 Cashel St had a fallen chimney and accordingly the building was yellow placarded.

Then on 1 October 2010 a further Earthquake Damage Inspection noted significant cracks in the parapet to the rear of the building requiring further investigation. A Level 2 Rapid Assessment on 12 October noted the chimney had been removed. It also noted a vertical crack the full height of the external wall on the staircase which needed to be checked by a CPEng. This was categorised as low risk and the building was green placarded.

There was a Level 2 Rapid Assessment of 91 Cashel St on 14 October noting vertical cracks in the east and west walls. That inspection also noted other cracks in the street frontage at the joint between the walls and horizontal members. A CPEng engineers report was requested to understand the significance of these further.

After the Boxing Day aftershock, a Level 1 Rapid Assessment of 91 Cashel St noted "loose bricks either end. Horizontal cracking." The building was red placarded.

The Council served a Building Act notice on the owners of 91 Cashel St recording those defects and requiring the work to be completed by 31 January 2011.

That same Building Act notice affected the properties on either side – 89 and 93 Cashel St – because of the risk to those buildings from the parapets on 91 Cashel St.

Opus, structural engineers, designed make-safe work for 91 Cashel St which was carried out by contractors and certified by Opus. A certificate completed by Alistair Boyce was received by the Council on 31 December and the Building Act notice and cordons in front of 91 Cashel St subsequently removed.

In the February 2011 earthquake there was a complete loss of the 3<sup>rd</sup> storey walls to the west, south and east elevations of 91 Cashel St, those walls falling both inwards

and outwards from the building. As a result the west wall fell onto 89 Cashel St and the east wall fell onto 93 Cashel St. Severe structural damage was caused to all buildings as a result.

Shane Tomlin was working at the Trocadero Bakery at 93 Cashel Street, on the 1<sup>st</sup> floor. A work colleague, Jaimini Shurety was standing near Mr Tomlin when the earthquake hit. After the earthquake stopped she saw a hole in the floor where Mr Tomlin had been standing. Mr Tomlin was located, conscious, but badly injured on the ground floor under the Trocadero Bakery premises in the TS Retail Store. He was taken to Christchurch Hospital but subsequently died as a result of injuries

Jillian Murphy was shopping with two friends in Deval which was situated at 89A Cashel Street. It is unclear whether she and her friends were inside the shop when the earthquake hit although this appears to be the case. The group appears to have exited the shop but Ms Murphy was seen by one of her friends, Debbie Lawson, heading back into the shop to get her handbag. At that time the building collapsed trapping Ms Murphy under rubble. Her body was recovered under collapsed building material.

Christopher Homan and his wife Christine Homan, were in Cashel Street, standing in the vicinity of 93 Cashel Street when the frontage of the buildings at 89, 91 & 93 Cashel Street fell away, pinning Mr Homan's legs under rubble. CPR was performed on him but he died at the scene.

Melissa Neale was walking in Cashel Street with her mother, Margaret Neale, intending to go to the Trocadero Bakery for lunch. They were a short distance from the building when the earthquake hit. Ms Neale's body was located under collapsed building material in the vicinity of 89, 91 and 93 Cashel Street.

**Proposed Witnesses:**

1. Peter Smith, Spencer Holmes Ltd, structural engineer
2. Christchurch City Council
3. Alistair Boyce, Opus Consultants, structural engineer
4. Andrew Brown, Opus Consultants, structural engineer
5. Tracey Gough, owner 91 Cashel Street
6. Antony Gough, owner 89 and 93 Cashel Street.

**Likely Issues**

1. Application of the Council's earthquake prone policy to the building
2. Assessment of the building following the September earthquake and the Boxing Day aftershock.
3. Assessment of the efficacy of the make-safe work carried out following the Boxing Day aftershock.