



CORPORATE OFFICE
LEVEL 1
101 LAMBTON QUAY
BOX 2799
WELLINGTON
PH 0-4-499 2489
FAX 0-4-499 2482
www.ero.govt.nz

2 May 2011

David Kelly
Deputy Chief Executive Building Quality
Building Investigation
Department of Building and Housing
Box 10729
WELLINGTON 6143

Dear Mr Kelly

**Christchurch Earthquake:
Education Review Office in Pyne Gould Corporation Building**

The Education Review Office has been a tenant in the Pyne Gould Corporation Building, Cambridge Terrace, in Christchurch since 2001. This means that ERO was there at the time of the earthquakes on 4 September 2010 and 22 February 2011.

To help with your investigation here is some background and information on ERO's tenancy in the building until its collapse on 22 February.

After the September 2010 earthquake we were advised by the Pyne Gould Corporation that Holmes Consulting Ltd, Structural Engineers, had inspected the building including cracks, and said that there was no need for concern. We enclose a copy of that email of 16 September 2010.

Subsequently, on 9 November 2010, ERO raised the issue of the cracks with NAI Harcourts who advised us that the building had been inspected; that these cracks were on other floors; and that the damage was superficial. Please see attached email 9 November 2010.

The major damage to our office from the September 2010 earthquake was falling ceiling tiles. Following that earthquake ERO arranged for the building's management to replace the heavy plaster ceiling tiles with much lighter versions. We enclose photos of our office in September 2010 showing the damage and the replacement work.

The PGC Building was completely destroyed in the 22 February earthquake. Six ERO staff members were in the building at the time of the earthquake. Five were rescued, physically unharmed, within a couple of hours, and one was found 26 hours later and was brought out safely with minor injuries.

Photos of the PGC building following the 22 February 2011 earthquake are enclosed.

If you would like to speak to ERO staff who were in the building at the time of the February earthquake, please contact Graham Randell, National Manager Southern Region.

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'G Stoop', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Graham Stoop
Chief Review Officer

From: Ann-Cherie Manawatu-Te Ra [mailto:ac.manawatu-tera@naiharcourts.co.nz]
Sent: Friday, April 15, 2011 01:28 PM
To: Bob McClymont - Marsh <bob.mcclymont@marsh.com>; Helen Bergstrom
(helen.bergstrom@mmc.com) <helen.bergstrom@mmc.com>; Peter Cambray
Cc: Howard Buchanan <howard.buchanan@naiharcourts.co.nz>
Subject: FW: 233 Cambridge Tce

Dear tenants,

On Tuesday the 1st of March I requested from the police at least 24 hours notice of release of the site to enable security to be established, so that any of your remaining possessions , files and vehicles could be retrieved.

Despite further inquiry to the police I have not received any indication when the site will be available.

We have supplied information about the building to BECA which has been appointed to the inquiry team investigating why the building collapsed.

BECA's rep has advised that just over a week ago he visited the site and took the attached photo and reported;

- 1 Demolition was down to ground level on the East side and to level 1 on the West
- 2 BECA requested the demolition be stopped to analyse the remaining structure
- 3 The outbuildings were largely untouched
- 4 BECA cannot offer any insight as to when the site will be released

We will keep you posted if/when more information comes to hand.
Regards Howard

Howard Buchanan BBS Prop. NZCB
Commercial Manager

Grenadier Real Estate Ltd, MREINZ, Licensed Agent REAA 2008
492 Moorhouse Avenue, PO Box 1625, Christchurch 8140, New Zealand
P +64 3 371 9126 M +64 21 673 766 F +64 3 371 9189
E howard.buchanan@naiharcourts.co.nz www.naiharcourts.co.nz



From: Louise.Sutherland [mailto:Louise.Sutherland@naiharcourts.co.nz]
Sent: Tuesday, 9 November 2010 9:15 a.m.
To: Glenys Ryan
Cc: Ann-Cherie Manawatu-Te Ra
Subject: RE: Education REview Office - Earthquake damage

Hi Glenys

Thanks for the update.

There is cracking similar to what you have described on other floors in the building.

These have been inspected on several occasions by structural engineers and confirmed as superficial and do not compromise the structural integrity of the building.

We are currently working with the landlord's insurer and will be appointing a project manager to oversee the damage assessment and repairs to the building. They will visit your tenancy and catalogue the damage and what repairs are necessary.

We will be in touch once we have instruction from the insurer and have been approved to appoint a project manager. I do not yet have an ETA, sorry.

Kind regards

Louise

Louise Sutherland
Commercial Property Manager

Grenadier Real Estate Ltd, MREINZ, Licensed Agent REAA 2008
271 Madras Street, PO Box 1625, Christchurch 8140, New Zealand
P +64 3 371 9126 M +64 21 220 0599 F +64 3 371 9189
E louise.sutherland@naiharcourts.co.nz www.naiharcourts.co.nz



From: Glenys Ryan [mailto:glenys.ryan@ero.govt.nz]
Sent: Friday, 5 November 2010 1:48 p.m.
To: Louise.Sutherland
Subject: Education REview Office - Earthquake damage

Hi Louise

Further to our other concerns. We have a crack in the wall on the east side – it appears to be where the wall partition (gib) comes in contact with the lift shaft. This is newer than the ones around the east side entrance door but on the same interior walls. It is very hard to send you any photos as our walls are grey. But if you need me to do so please let me know. I wondered if any of the other floors have similar cracks.

Regards
Glenys Ryan
Administration Officer
Education Review Office
Christchurch

From: Peter Cambray
Sent: Friday, 22 October 2010 12:26 p.m.
To: Louise.Sutherland
Cc: ac.manawatu-tera@naiharcourts.co.nz
Subject: RE: Ceiling Tiles etc

Hi Louise & Ann-Cherie

Just a couple of follow ups really. Following the most recent 5.1 aftershock I understand there was some minor damage to ceiling tiles again. Is there any plan to replace the tiles with the lighter tiles?

I also understand from Glenys that there is now an evident crack in the plaster of one of the internal walls on the east side of our office. I suspect not load-bearing, but again it needs checking.

Along with many other people in Canterbury, of course, our staff are now hyper-sensitive to any real or imagined problems. One that has been raised is egress in the event of significant problems. If the power goes off, do the internal doors automatically get released? If not, is the only egress via the external fire escapes? Is there, or do you plan to develop, a full building evacuation plan?

Thanks for this.

Peter Cambray
Support Manager Southern
Education Review Office
P O Box 902, Dunedin; P O Box 25102 Christchurch
ph - (03) 365 5860 ddi (03) 470 3273 cell: 0275382453

From: Louise.Sutherland [<mailto:Louise.Sutherland@naiharcourts.co.nz>]
Sent: Wednesday, 22 September 2010 8:38 a.m.
To: Peter Cambray
Subject: RE: Ceiling Tiles

Hi Peter

I will forward your email to my colleague, Ann-Cherie who is actual the manager for the building and handling this side of things (I assist Ann-Cherie).

For future reference her email address is: ac.manawatu-tera@naiharcourts.co.nz

Kind regards

Louise



Project Name: PGC BUILDING .233 CAMBRIDGE
 Project No: —
 S.R. No: —
 Date: 14/10/10
 Reviewed By: MARK WHITESIDE

SITE REPORT

Work Reviewed:

PGC BUILDING. REINSPECTION, GROUND FLOOR WINDOW FRAME GAP, 2nd FLOOR PARTITION CRACK.

Observations & Comments:

GROUND FLOOR ~ WINDOW FRAMES SPAN FROM FLOOR TO FLOOR.

ALUMINIUM MULLIONS HAVE MOVED INTERNAL CABINETLY CREATING A GAP. [OR ENLARGING]

NO STRUCTURAL ISSUES.

GAP SHOULD BE ADDRESSED FOR WEATHER PROOFING.

SECOND FLOOR.

- PARTITION CRACK AT CONCRETE INTERFACE - NO STRUCTURAL ISSUES

BUILDING REMAINS STRUCTURALLY OKAY TO OCCUPY ON ABOVE OBSERVATIONS.

HolmesConsultingGroup



Copies to:

MARK WHITESIDE
 Structural Engineer
 BE (Hons) ME
 Level 5, 123 Victoria Street
 PO Box 25355
 Christchurch 8144
 New Zealand
 T +64 3 366 3366
 F +64 3 379 2169
 DDI +64 3 363 2171
 E markw@holmesgroup.com

From: Golding, Helen [mailto:Helen.Golding@pgc.co.nz]

Sent: Thursday, 16 September 2010 11:03 a.m.

To: Dudley, Brett; Dudley, Brett; Ballingall, Anne; Scott, Glenis; Thoms, Russell V; Glenys Ryan

Cc: Hair, Colin; Discombe, Michelle

Subject: Holmes Consulting Limited - Constructural Engineers



Good Morning



As you will be aware, a representative from the above company, has been and inspected our building and associated problems ie cracks. He is pleased to report that there is no need for any concern as they are superficial problems only. He will report direct to Harcourts, who now manage the building, his findings.

Kind Regards,

Helen Golding

Pyne Gould Corporation

 DDI 03 924 3192 |  Fax 03 379 8616

 Web www.pgc.co.nz |  Email helen.golding@pgc.co.nz

 Post PO Box 167, Christchurch, New Zealand

This e-mail message and accompanying attachments may contain information that is confidential. If you are not the intended recipient, you must not read, use, distribute or copy any contents of this e-mail message or attachments. If you have received this e-mail in error, please delete it and notify us by reply e-mail.

Thank you.

Louise Sutherland
Commercial Property Manager

Grenadier Real Estate Ltd, MREINZ, Licensed Agent REAA 2008
271 Madras Street, PO Box 1625, Christchurch 8140, New Zealand
P +64 3 371 9126 M +64 21 220 0599 F +64 3 371 9189
E louise.sutherland@naiharcourts.co.nz www.naiharcourts.co.nz



From: Peter Cambray [<mailto:Peter.Cambray@ero.govt.nz>]
Sent: Wednesday, 22 September 2010 8:33 a.m.
To: Louise.Sutherland
Subject: Ceiling Tiles

Hi Louise

Sorry if I'm going over old ground here, but I see that Marsh (who suffered more actual damage than us) are having all their heavy ceiling tiles replaced by a lighter, safer model.

I understand that the person installing the new tiles has indicated that he cannot guarantee the safety of our tiles due to their weight. Can you update me on this and tell me if there are plans to replace the tiles on 3rd floor too? I am obviously concerned that our staff should not be exposed to any risk from these tiles.

Thanks for this

Peter Cambray
Support Manager Southern
Education Review Office
P O Box 902, Dunedin; P O Box 25102 Christchurch
ph - (03) 365 5860 ddi (03) 470 3273 cell: 0275382453

Caution: The content of this email is the property of the Education Review Office and is intended only for the addressee. If you have received this message in error, please notify the sender immediately and delete.



EAO Office Bldg 9 Sept 2010

ERO OFFICE
PUL BUILDING
SCOT 10
(CH)
Level 4



EMERGENCY
PAC BLDG CH. SEPT 2010 Level 4





END OFFICE
 PQC BCDa
 CH
 SCOT 2010
 Level 4



PGC Bldg 9 Sept 2010 CA.



Ch Sept 2010



Pac BLDG Sept 2010.



Ch. Sept 2010









